

Decision Maker: Portfolio Holder for Transport, Highways & Road Safety

**FOR PRE-DECISION SCRUTINY BY THE ENVIRONMENT AND
COMMUNITY SERVICES POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND SCRUTINY
COMMITTEE ON:**

Date: Tuesday 22 November 2022

Decision Type: Non-Urgent Executive Key Non-Key

Title: PARKING SERVICES - REVIEW OF PARKING FEES AND CHARGING PROCESSES

Contact Officer: Chloe Wenbourne, Head of Shared Parking Services
E-mail: Chloe.Wenbourne@bromley.gov.uk

Chief Officer: Director of Environment and Public Protection

Ward: (All Wards);

1. Reason for decision/report and options

A Review has been undertaken of all parking charges across the Borough in line with the agreed Parking Strategy since the last review in 2019. The report recommends charges for on and off-street parking fees as well as parking permits.

The report also recommends charges be introduced in 4 new locations and that all pay and display machines, both on and off street, are removed within the next 6 months so that the Borough becomes a cashless only Borough, with the exception of the one ANPR Civic Centre car park.

2. RECOMMENDATION(S)

That the Environment Portfolio Holder agrees to the following:

- The proposed tariff increases of 20p to all on and off-street parking locations, as set out in section 3 and appendix one.
- The proposed tariff review timescale being changed to every 2 years as set out in section 3.
- The proposed tariff charges for The Civic Offices car park as set out in section 4.
- The proposed changes to The Hill car park as set out in section 5.
- The proposed evening tariff in Mitre Close as set out in section 6
- The proposed implementation of tariffs in the existing free on and off-street parking places as detailed in section 7
- The proposed permit charges as set out in section 8.
- The proposal to accelerate the removal of all pay and display machines across the Borough as set out in section 9.

Impact on Vulnerable Adults and Children

1. Summary of Impact: Full Equality Impact Assessment has been completed and published.
-

Transformation Policy

1. Policy Status: Parking Strategy
 2. Making Bromley Even Better Priority: To manage our resources well, providing value for money, and efficient and effective services for Bromley's residents.
-

Financial

1. Cost of proposal: £127k
 2. Ongoing costs: Savings in 2023/24 of approximately £804k and in 2024/25 of £967k
 3. Budget head/performance centre: Parking Services
 4. Total current budget for this head: £9m
 5. Source of funding: Revenue Controllable Budgets
-

Personnel

1. Number of staff (current and additional): 5 FTE
 2. If from existing staff resources, number of staff hours: 1,100 hours
-

Legal

1. Legal Requirement: Non-Statutory - Government Guidance:
 2. Call-in: Applicable:
-

Procurement

1. Summary of Procurement Implications: Parking controls are managed and enforced under the term contract with APCOA, which is in year six of a ten-year contract.

Property

1. Summary of Property Implications: n/a
-

Carbon Reduction and Social Value

1. Summary of Carbon Reduction/Sustainability Implications: The reduction of cash collections on the pay and display machines and the need for the patrols to visit the machines will reduce the Parking Contractor's carbon footprint.
-

Customer Impact

1. Estimated number of users or customers (current and projected): All road users of the Borough.
-

Ward Councillor Views

1. Have Ward Councillors been asked for comments? Ward Councillors in Wards specifically impacted have been asked for comments to be shared at committee.
2. Summary of Ward Councillors comments: n/a

3. COMMENTARY

Surface Car Parks and On Street parking

- 3.1 Charges in all car parks and on-street parking bays are reviewed every four years, with the last review being completed in February 2019, therefore a review of all parking charges has been completed by Officers with the proposed implementation date of the 1 April 2023.
- 3.2 There has been a general decrease in the usage of the surface (ground-level) car parks and on street parking in the Borough, more so with the Covid pandemic; motorist behaviours have changed, and this is reflected in the 28% decrease in car park usage since 2019/20. Comparing the 2021/22 usage levels of all car parks against that of 2019/20, there were 467,121 less parking sessions purchased, this resulted in just over £1m less income being generated. Please see sections 4 and 5 of the report for further information on the two multistorey car parks.
- 3.3 The on and off-street fees have not been increased since April 2020, however the contract costs have increased annually by inflation, therefore a review of the tariffs are now necessary.
- 3.4 Officers considered all options at this stage and estimates showed that based on the same parking levels as seen in 2021/22, an increase of 20p per tariff set could be an additional increase of income of £703,296 p/a for all on and off-street parking locations (excluding the two multistorey car parks). Allowing for a potential drop off in usage of 5% (the “rejection rate”) over the next year, officers project that this would be an additional income of approximately £445,975 p/a.
- 3.5 Appendix three has a list of the difference in usage and income for all 25 surface car parks since 2018/19. This clearly demonstrates the real impact that the pandemic has had on the demand for the car parks, with the station car parks being most effected.
- 3.6 Appendix one shows the current tariffs and the proposed tariff going forward with the 20p increase for all on and off-street locations, excluding the two muti-stories car parks.
- 3.7 If approved, these changes could be implemented for April 2023 as a range of practical and statutory actions would need to be undertaken before the revised prices could come into effect, including a 21-day Notice of Variation amendment of the various Traffic Management Orders, machine software updates, tariff sign changes, and the Council’s Web site would also need updating.
- 3.8 Officers generally review the parking tariffs every 4 years, however due to the drastic changes that the Covid pandemic has had on parking demand, the data over last few years does not fully establish a set trend of usage. It is therefore proposed that a further review is undertaken in 2 years’ time to confirm that the above strategy is the best option for both the Council and the motorists of the Borough.

| On and Off Street Total Income Projections | | | | | | |
|--|-----------------|---------------|---------------|----------------------|---------------|--|
| Based on 21/22 actuals not budget | | | | | | |
| Bromley 22-23 | Avg transaction | £1.26 | 0.1 | 0.2 | 0.3 | |
| P&D + cashless income | Usage | No increase | 10p increase | 20p increase | 30p increase | |
| 0% rejection rate | 3,516,481 | £4,443,125.50 | £4,794,773.59 | £5,146,421.68 | £5,498,069.77 | |
| 5% rejection rate | 3,340,657 | £4,220,969.22 | £4,555,034.91 | £4,889,100.60 | £5,223,166.28 | |
| 10% rejection rate | 3,164,833 | £3,998,812.95 | £4,315,296.23 | £4,631,779.51 | £4,948,262.79 | |
| 15% rejection rate | 2,989,009 | £3,776,656.67 | £4,075,557.55 | £4,374,458.43 | £4,673,359.31 | |
| 20% rejection rate | 2,813,185 | £3,554,500.40 | £3,835,818.87 | £4,117,137.34 | £4,398,455.82 | |

| Difference to standard projection vs above | | | | | | |
|--|----------|--------------|--------------|--------------------|---------------|--|
| Bromley 22-23 | | | 0.1 | 0.2 | 0.3 | |
| P&D + cashless income | Usage | No increase | 10p increase | 20p increase | 30p increase | |
| 0% rejection rate | 0 | £0.00 | £351,648.09 | £703,296.18 | £1,054,944.27 | |
| 5% rejection rate | -175,824 | -£222,156.27 | £111,909.41 | £445,975.10 | £780,040.79 | |
| 10% rejection rate | -351,648 | -£444,312.55 | -£127,829.27 | £188,654.02 | £505,137.30 | |
| 15% rejection rate | -527,472 | -£666,468.82 | -£367,567.95 | -£68,667.07 | £230,233.81 | |
| 20% rejection rate | -703,296 | -£888,625.10 | -£607,306.63 | -£325,988.15 | -£44,669.68 | |

4. Civic Offices Multistorey Car Park

- 4.1 The Civic Offices car park was upgraded to an Automatic Number Plate Recognition (ANPR) system in 2020. The upgrade enabled the Authority to provide a completely paperless parking solution. Once a vehicle enters the car park, the ANPR cameras record the vehicle's registration and after the motorist has made payment (subject to agreed exemptions), as the vehicle leaves the car park the ANPR system cross references the vehicle registration with the payment, and the exemption database is cross referenced to confirm that the vehicle is entitled to leave.
- 4.2 The Civic Offices Car Park has 691 parking spaces, 19 disabled bays; 2 electric vehicle charging points, this is including the section that has recently been used for the vaccination centre parking.
- 4.3 The Civic Offices car park has also been a casualty of the Covid Pandemic with statistics from the parking machines software showing 25% fewer parking sessions being purchased in 2021/22 in comparison to 2019/20; this equates to just over £368,482 less income over the year – a decrease of 37%.

| Civic Offices Car Park | Parking Sessions | Income |
|------------------------|------------------|-----------|
| 18/19 | 424,075 | £ 983,836 |
| 19/20 | 383,345 | £ 982,147 |
| 20/21 | 101,586 | £ 278,213 |
| 21/22 | 286,745 | £ 613,665 |

| Time of Session Purchased | 1 Hour | 2 Hour | 3 Hours | 4 Hours | 5 Hours | 6 Hours | 7-24 Hours | Total |
|---|--------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|------------|---------|
| 2021/22 | 76,862 | 119,999 | 56,326 | 22,350 | 7,531 | 2,238 | 1,439 | 286,745 |
| Percentage of overall purchased tickets | 27% | 42% | 20% | 8% | 3% | 1% | 1% | |

- 4.4 The car park is used for mostly short stay parking, with the most popular length of stay being 2 hours with 42% of sessions being purchased in comparison to only 2% of sessions being purchased for 7-24 hours tariffs.
- 4.5 The current hourly tariff is £1.30 per hour and then after 6 hours it is £14. The higher tariff was originally introduced to discourage all day parking and allowed for a constant turnover of vehicles helping to maximise the income in the car park and provide sufficient parking opportunity for the town centre. Over recent years, with the demand for the car park changing, the capacity in the car park is less than 50% full, therefore there is now the opportunity to change the tariff structure to encourage reasonably priced long stay parking.
- 4.6 The car park has direct competition with the Glades Shopping Centre which is 20p cheaper on the hourly tariff and £2 cheaper for the 6 Hour and over tariff at £12. It is therefore recommended to keep the tariffs the same but to try and encourage more long stay parking in the Civic Offices car park by reducing the over 6h tariff to £7 to undercut the competition.
- 4.7 Based on 2021/22 statistics, Officers accept that there is a risk of loss of income for those who are already using the long stay facility of the car park and paying the £14 fee would now be receiving a cheaper tariff, however this was only just over £20,000 of income per year in 2021/22. Officers are confident that with the right advertising on social media, the Council's web site and a banner outside the Civic Offices the car park can start to be used for long stay parking, especially by those working in retail at the Glades or in the High Street, who have been put off previously by the high cost of all day parking.
- 4.8 Due to proposed large decrease in the long stay parking tariff in the Civic Offices car park, it is recommended that a review of the Civic Offices car park is completed after one year.
- 4.9 It is recommended these changes commence in April 2023.

5. The Hill Multistorey Car Park

- 5.1 The Hill Multi-Story car park has 752 parking spaces, 8 disabled bays, 1 motorcycle bay and 2 electric vehicle charging point bays. Over the last few years, there has been a decline in usage and therefore a decline in income from this car park, please see the table:

| Year | Parking Sessions | Income |
|-------|------------------|----------|
| 18/19 | 256,776 | £645,821 |
| 19/20 | 239,403 | £641,694 |
| 20/21 | 80,865 | £273,711 |
| 21/22 | 185,719 | £493,409 |

- 5.2 The car park is manned between the hours of 7am to 9pm, Monday to Saturday, and 8am to 7pm on Sundays.
- 5.3 Officers propose to remove the Car Park Attendants, the car park barriers and the pay on foot payment machines and make the car park cashless-only and patrolled by CEOs, the same as most other car parks within the Borough.
- 5.4 Due to the continual decline in usage and the Anti-Social Behaviour (ASB) happening on the top levels of the car park, officers recommend fencing off the top couple of floors of the car park.

This will reduce capacity which is not being fulfilled and reduce the area for enforcement, allowing the CEOs to enforce a much smaller car park, which will add to this saving proposal.

- 5.5 Removing the manned aspect and all the equipment would have a one-off cost of £36,770, however there would be an annual contract saving off £65,360. This would be without removing the advantages of the pay-on-foot aspect of the car park as users would be able to pay through their mobile phones to extend a visit (a facility which is not available at this time).
- 5.6 The benefits of a cashless system mirror those associated with pay-on-foot solutions as customers can shop in the town centre for longer than they planned as they can extend their parking session via their mobile phone, therefore reducing the risk of receiving a Penalty Charge Notice (PCN).
- 5.7 The current tariff for this car park is £1.30 per hour and £5.20 over 3 hours. Officers propose to keep this tariff the same, but by moving to a cashless only car park the motorist will have to pay an additional 20p service fee to RingGo.
- 5.8 It is recommended these changes commence in April 2023.

| One Off Charges | | | |
|--------------------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| Service | Unit Rate | Number of Units | Total Charge |
| Removal of pay-on-foot machine | £ 823.31 | 5 | £ 4,116.55 |
| Removal of each barrier | £ 493.99 | 4 | £ 1,975.96 |
| Redundancy costs (contractor) | | | £ 30,678.00 |
| Total | | | £ 36,770.51 |
| Annual Contract fee reduction | | | |
| MSCP 700-800 spaces | -£ 92,213.74 | 1 | -£ 92,213.74 |
| Cash collections | -£ 6.10 | 260 | -£ 1,586.00 |
| Surface car park management | £ 75.63 | 376 | £ 28,439.00 |
| Total | | | -£ 65,360.74 |
| Annual Contract Savings | | | |
| | 23/24 | 24/25 | 25/26 |
| Saving to the Parking contract | -£ 28,590.23 | -£ 65,360.74 | -£ 65,360.74 |

6 Overnight charging at Mitre Close Car Park in Bromley Town Centre

- 6.1 Mitre Close Car Park is a busy car park in Bromley Town Centre, comprising 25 bays and is chargeable Monday-Sunday, 8:30am – 6:30pm. This car park is next to The Hill Multi-story Car Park which is chargeable in the evening at £1.30 from 6:30pm to 7:29am.

- 6.2 Mitre Close is quite often very busy in the evening as people will park in this car park to avoid the fees at The Hill. It is therefore proposed that an evening charge is introduced at the same rate as The Hill Car Park, £1.30.
- 6.3 On a projection of every bay within the car park having one vehicle parked in it each evening or overnight, every Thursday, Friday, Saturday and Sunday of the year, this could be a potential income of £6,760 pa.
- 6.4 It is recommended these changes commence in April 2023.

7 Charging motorists to park in the current free car parks / limited waiting bays

- 7.1 The Council currently have 3 car parks across the Borough that are free to park in and one car park that is free but for disabled badge holders only. Officers recommend that tariffs should be introduced as set out here:
 - **Crown Lane, Bromley** - Crown Lane is a 25-space car park situated alongside the actual road Crown Lane, Bromley. It is mostly used by residents and college students with approximately 75% of spaces being utilized daily. It is recommended to introduce a tariff of 60p per hour, with a maximum charge of £3.00 per day.
 - **Homefield Rise, Orpington** – Homefield Rise car park is a 16-space disabled badge holder only car park until 6:29pm, from 6:30pm to midnight the car park is currently free to all motorists. This car park could become chargeable between 6:30pm to 8:00am with a set overnight fee of £1.50 to allow motorists to utilise these spaces in the evening with cashless only, as officers are aware that people park there to use the cinema in the evening.
 - **Sundridge Park, Bromley** – Sundridge Park car park is a 77- space car park that is free to all motorist in the area. It is located next to a train station and allows commuters to park all day for free. It is recommended to introduce a tariff of 60p per hour, with a maximum charge of £3.00 per day.
- 7.2 The Council are responsible for paying the business rates and maintenance within each of these car parks, therefore they are currently running at a loss, by adding a tariff to park it will help the service meet these running costs. Currently the income from other car parks has to subsidise the running costs of these three car parks.
- 7.3 The Council would need to consider the displacement of vehicles for those motorists who choose not to pay at the car park and find somewhere else to park; additional on street controls may be needed to assist with this situation such as extensions/new Controlled Parking Zones. It is likely to take longer to introduce required parking controls in streets around the Sundridge Park car park than in the other two car parks.
- 7.4 The Council would need to pay for the Traffic Management Orders to be amended as well as paying for new signage. To minimise the implementation costs as well as the maintenance costs, it would be recommended that these car parks would be cashless only.
- 7.5 An estimate of income is shown below. This is based on each available parking space being parked in for 4 hours per day, Monday to Friday, 52 weeks per year, charged at the tariffs in 4.1, Monday to Friday only. For Homefield rise, the calculations are estimated at 50% of the spaces being utilised 3 nights per week.

- 7.6 In Main Road, Biggin Hill there are approximately 30 limited-time waiting bays which could be turned into cashless only parking bays at 60p per hour. Enforcing limited-time waiting bays can be extremely difficult and time consuming for the Civil Enforcement Officers (CEO's) as they must visit each bay twice and log the vehicle before they can enforce. Changing these bays to paid-for parking will allow for the bays to be enforced effectively, freeing up the resource of the CEO as well as ensuring the turnover of the bay is achieved, which in turn will support the local shops.

| | Costs | Additional Income |
|--|-----------------|--------------------------|
| Service | Unit Rate | |
| Amendment to Traffic Management Orders (23/24) | £ 2,000 | |
| New Signs and lines (23/24) | £ 1,000 | |
| Cashless system configuration (23/24) | £ 2,000 | |
| Additional annual enforcement costs for Crown Lane (24/25) | £ 3,900 | |
| Additional annual enforcement costs for Sundridge Park (24/25) | £ 7,750 | |
| Additional annual enforcement costs for Homefield (24/25) | £ - | |
| Projected Income for Crown Lane (24/25) | | -£ 10,400 |
| Projected Income for Sundridge Park (24/25) | | -£ 19,000 |
| Projected Income for Homefield (24/25) | | -£ 4,320 |
| Projected income for Main Road (24/25) | | -£ 14,000 |
| Totals | £ 16,650 | £47,720 |

| | 23/24 | 24/25 |
|---------------|----------------|------------------|
| Totals | £ 5,000 | -£ 36,070 |

- 7.7 Implementation of these changes is recommended for April 2024.

8. Permits – Resident, Business and Visitor Vouchers

- 8.1 The Covid pandemic has changed residents' behaviours and therefore there has been a small increase in the number of resident parking permits purchased. This may reflect residents home working more. However, there has been a decrease in the number of business permits and season tickets purchased.

| | Residents Permits | Visitor Vouchers | Business Permits | Season Tickets |
|---------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|----------------|
| 2019/20 | 7147 | 2024 | 418 | 121 |
| 2020/21 | 7659 | 1851 | 371 | 93 |
| 2021/22 | 7724 | 2351 | 356 | 81 |

- 8.2 Officers have reviewed the permit demand and the charges in line with our neighbouring Boroughs (please see Appendix two) as well as the on-going cost for the provision of civil parking enforcement and therefore propose the following changes:

| Type of Permit | Current Cost | Proposed Cost |
|---|--------------|---------------|
| Residents Permit – Restrictions 4 hours and under | £50 | £80 |
| Residents Permit – Restrictions over 4 hours | £100 | £150 |
| Visitor Vouchers - Restrictions 4 hours and under | £45 | No change |
| Visitor Vouchers - Restrictions over 4 hours | £55 | No change |
| Business Permit – Standard Locations | £125 | No change |
| Business Permit - Premium Locations | £275 | No change |

- 8.3 The potential extra income from this increase would be £311,940 p/a on top of the existing income of £586,760 based on the 2021/22 data. This increase is recommended so that the income keeps pace with the cost of enforcement and also covers the cost of ongoing changes needed in CPZs.

| Existing permit Cost | Number of permits sold in 21/22 | Existing Income | Potential extra Income |
|----------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------|------------------------|
| £50.00 | 3713 | £ 185,650.00 | £ 111,390.00 |
| £100 | 4011 | £ 401,100.00 | £ 200,550.00 |
| Total | 7724 | £ 586,750.00 | £ 311,940.00 |

- 8.4 Officers have not recommended the increase of Visitor Vouchers fees as although we are seeing an increase in the demand, the cost of the vouchers is on the higher side in comparison to neighbouring boroughs.
- 8.5 Implementation of these changes to permit fees is recommended for April 2023.

9 Removal of Pay and Display Machines

- 9.1 There are currently 131 pay and display machines across the Borough, 100 machines are on street and 31 in car parks.
- 9.2 It was agreed in November 2019, report number ES19066, that delegated authority would be given to the Director of Environment & Public Protection for the removal of P&D machines across the Borough in consultation with the Portfolio Holder.
- 9.3 Since this decision, officers have been removing machines around the Borough with the most recent removal agreed in November 2021 by former Portfolio Holder Councillor Huntington-Thresher where a further 66 machines, 53 on street and 13 from the car parks, would be removed; this was completed in September 2022.
- 9.4 As detailed in section 3 of this report, officers are aware that the pay and display machines across the Borough are prone to breaking down, and on some occasions will take a considerable time to be fixed as parts are not easy to purchase due to the age of the machines. Officers recognise that this is providing a poor service for the motorist as well as frustration when they pay for their parking session but no pay and display ticket is produced.

- 9.5 The table within Appendix three shows the split between cash and cashless parking sessions per car park over the last three years; the data demonstrates that a natural increase in the cashless facility is being adopted in most car parks, with 38% of all off street parking income being purchased via the cashless system in 2019/20, with an increase to 73% in 2021/22.
- 9.6 As mentioned above in 9.3, pay and display machines are quite often broken into, in the last financial year, £ 15,834.60 was stolen from the pay and display machines.
- 9.7 Officers have recently been made aware of the '3G Sunset' which is a shutdown of all 3G sim cards. All of the pay and display machines in surface car parks and on street have a 3G sim card within the machines, once these sims are shut down, the machines will not be able to communicate with the back-office systems. This would mean Parking Services and the Parking Contractor would have no way of knowing if a machine was out of order, the cash box was full, needed a new ticket roll etc. Officers would also be unable to provide data on usage of the machine.
- 9.8 Early discussions with APCOA have confirmed that Vodaphone, the Council's sim provider will remove their support of the cards between Feb 23 to April 23, therefore in order for the machines to continue to work, an upgrade of the sim cards would be required at a cost of £700 per machine, a total cost of £91,700 for all 131 machines.
- 9.9 The service cannot continue with the poor quality of the machines and the ongoing problems; therefore, officers have considered the options available to the service, officers believe the options are as follows:
- Accelerate the machine removal process, becoming a cashless Borough providing a more efficient service to the public. There would be a one-off cost of £50,331.51 to remove the machines, however there would be an annual contract saving of approximately £102,349.
 - Replace the most used machines that are most prone to going out of service at a cost of £6,000 per machine (this will include removing the old machines, purchasing and installing a new machine), as well as paying for the £700 sim upgrade fee.
 - Replace all 131 machines at a cost of approximately £877,700 (this will include the sim upgrade for the machines). The Council would have to accept that these machines would be prone to being broken into and that the Council would not recover the cost on this investment as this is a declining service.
 - Replace all 131 machines at a cost of approximately £877,700 (this will include the sim upgrade for the machines) but with credit card contactless machines, however, additional card merchant charges will be introduced to the service, this will cost the service in more running fees and will add more pressure to the existing budget gap within the service.
- 9.10 With the continuing growth of the cashless system, the usage in the pay and display machines naturally decreasing, the continual problems with machines being broken into and the shutdown of the 3G sims, officers recommend that the machine removal of the remaining 131 pay and display machines is accelerated.
- 9.11 Whilst considering the Borough's options, Parking Services arranged, via London Councils, for an email to be sent to all London Boroughs asking what their current position was in relation to if

they had moved to cashless only or if they used pay and display machines still. The replies are summarised in Appendix four.

- 9.12 Out of the 16 boroughs that responded, 1 came back that they had pay and display machines and a cashless system, 8 had cashless and a pay point system, 5 were just cashless and 2 have committee reports pending for the recommendation to move to cashless only. A pay point system is a parking cash facility where a motorist can purchase their parking session at a local business instead of using the RingGo cashless system directly.
- 9.13 Officers understand that not all motorist want to use the cashless system, with a projected 29% of all off street sessions within the car park being purchased via the pay and display machines, therefore officers will help with these changes by arranging for posters and 'how to guides' to be installed by the existing machines, leaflets and posters can be placed at suitable locations such as libraries, doctors surgeries, community resource centres etc and provide the extra support to those who need it.
- 9.14 There are various ways to use the cashless system: there is a parking app that can be downloaded and an account can be created, this will save up to 5 vehicles registrations within one account and will remember the card details, making paying for a parking session as quick as possible. Motorists that do not have a smart phone can also use the cashless system by calling a landline or sending a text message; all telephone numbers are displayed on the information boards at each location.
- 9.15 The current cashless provider, RingGo, is very reliable and if at any time they are experiencing any technical problems, the service is made aware of this so that we can report the date, time and the details of the problem. Bromley Council have been using RingGo as a cashless provider since 2010 and since 2017 this service has been procured via the main APCOA Parking Contractor where the KPI default linked to this service have never been applied, due to the reliability of the system.
- 9.16 Due to the various reasons explained above, it is recommend that the remaining 131 machines are removed by April 2023, this will be in line with the 3G sims being unsupported. Due to the timeframe, officers will need to recruit a consultant to help with the operational aspect of this project, including amending the Traffic Orders both on and off street as well as changing the signage on street.
- 9.17 Most cashless providers, including RingGo have an alternative system, however, reports from other London Boroughs are that whilst this system can provide a cash payment system, it can introduce further problems to the authority and has had virtually no uptake in boroughs where it has been introduced.
- 9.18 Operationally, this would involve increased costs to the Council to run the system, it would also make enforcement incredibly difficult. Civil Enforcement Officers would have to allow time for a customer to walk to the pay point location and pay for parking before being able to enforce any parking controls, this would be extremely difficult for all locations but especially the car parks, therefore the use of pay point is not recommended.
- 9.19 The below table is a breakdown of the one off costs and potential savings to the Parking Contract.

| Service | Unit Rate | Number of Units | One off / annual fees |
|--|-----------|-----------------|-----------------------|
| Removal of P&D machines solar (one-off) | £ 384.21 | 131 | £ 50,331.51 |
| Management/Maintenance Costs (annual) | £ 409.47 | 131 | -£ 53,640.57 |
| Cash Collections (annual) | £ 6.10 | 7985 | -£ 48,708.50 |
| Consultant to amend the Traffic Orders (one-off) | £ 35,000 | 1 | £ 35,000 |

| | 23/24 | 24/25 and beyond |
|-------------|--------------|------------------|
| Net Savings | -£ 17,017.56 | -£ 102,349.07 |

- 9.20 The Council have a responsibility to consider the Equalities Act when removing a service such as the pay and display machines and those people who maybe more prone to being disadvantaged or excluded by the changes, therefore a full Equality Impact Assessment has been completed and published.
- 9.21 Officers have considered that removing the facility of cash payment may be a disappointment to some motorists and arguably it may disappoint and inconvenience more of the older generation who may not own a phone or be confident using them, however whilst researching this further, some recent statistics for the UK show that 92% of UK adults own a smartphone in 2022, and within the last 6 years the smartphone adoption rate has nearly doubled for the 55 - 75 years old.
- 9.22 The biggest change in smartphone adoption in the past six years was noted among older adults. Namely, the number of smartphone users in the 45-54 age group increased from 60% in 2013 to 90% in 2019. Smartphone penetration in the UK in the 55 to 77 age group, on the other hand, doubled in the same period, going up from 40 to 80%. - (Deloitte UK)
- 9.23 This data suggests that although a number of motorists choose to use the pay and display machines, the majority of the population, especially those who drive, would own a phone.
- 9.24 Officers would reduce the inconvenience to those that have not used the cashless system before by arranging for additional signage to be installed advising the motorist that the machines will be removed, that the only payment method will be the cashless system, and set out clearly how the cashless system can be used. This would be displayed before the machines were removed, giving drivers time to adapt to the new way of paying to park.
- 9.25 Offices would happily give extra advice to any motorists really struggling, as well as adding extra guidance on the Council's web site, including a step-by-step guide. Information signs would also be installed in libraries, community resource centres, GP surgeries and via on-street electronic posters. A draft poster of the on and off-street communications can be found on Appendix five, further step by step instructions will be placed at all car parks to assist those moving over to the RingGo system.
- 9.26 As noted above, Parking Services have removed a number of machines over the last few years making areas cashless only, these include but are not limited to Copers Cope area, parts of Clockhouse, Orpington, Petts Wood and Chislehurst. No formal complaints have been received within these schemes and whilst it's difficult to fully compare the statistics due to the Covid Pandemic, officers are confident that usage has not been affected as a result of these changes.

- 9.27 Officers have started a Frequently Asked Question (FAQ) sheet on the proposed machine removal and the move to becoming a cashless only Borough, please see Appendix 6.

10. TRANSFORMATION/POLICY IMPLICATIONS

These recommendations will help take forward the Council's policy of reducing the number of pay and display machines around the Borough and reducing the ongoing maintenance costs on the Parking Enforcement Contract.

11. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 11.1 Section 3 and Appendix 1 of the report recommends a fee increase of 20p per tariff is approved. If the 2021/22 parking levels are maintained, the potential additional income for the council could be £703k p/a for all on and off-street parking locations (excluding the two multistorey car parks). Increased fees may lead to reduced usage, this scenario has been modelled and if there were a drop off in usage of 5% over the next year we can still generate additional income of approx. £446k p/a.
- 11.2 Section 4 of the report recommends a reduction of the over 6h tariff at the Civic Centre car park to £7 instead of £14 to encourage greater longer parking stays and undercut the competition at the Glades car park opposite in the hope of attracting retail staff over to the civic car park. The potential risk of this change is a loss of income from those already paying the £14 rate as their fee would be reduced, but this is hoped to be more than off-set by the increase in customers using this parking tariff given the right advertising and social media awareness.
- 11.3 Section 5 of the report recommends removing all manned aspects and equipment in the Hill Multistorey Car Park, although this would incur a one-off cost of £37k, this will be off-set with an annual saving of £65k. Going cashless and offering RingGo will allow for customers to extend parking on their mobile thus allowing them greater convenience and time to shop.
- 11.4 Section 6 of the report recommends bringing Mitre Close car park overnight charging in line with The Hill and introduce a £1.30 charge after 6.30pm, this should bring a small £6.7k increase in parking income per annum.
- 11.5 Section 7 of the report recommends various other free car parks around the Borough to begin charging as they are currently running at a loss as they still require security, rates and maintenance. There are one-off costs of approx. £5k plus annual costs of £11k, however there is expected to be additional annual net income from these car parks of £36k; these changes are recommended to be implemented from April 2024.
- 11.6 Section 8 of the report refers to changes to various permits (resident and business). If these were implemented, there would be an expected £312k rise in parking income for the service annually if permit demand remained at current levels.
- 11.7 Section 9 of the report recommends the removal of the 131 Pay and Display machines across the Borough from April 2023, which would generate contract savings of £17k in 2023/24 and £102k in 2024/25 ongoing. An accelerated removal process would incur a one-off cost of £85k. There is a significant need for this work to be accelerated as Vodaphone is expected to turn off the 3G network from Feb 23, all of the parking machines run off this network and with the switch off these machines will no longer work. If we do not replace these machines with cashless systems like RingGo, then we risk the loss of income, as well as reputational risk to the authority from customer complaints of faulty machines that we are not aware of due to the system being down.

- 11.8 In summary the various changes on this paper can potentially bring about savings/income of approx. £967k by 2024/25 to the Council which currently has significant budget pressures and a budget gap to fund in 2023/24 onwards.

11. LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

To implement these changes, amendments to both the on and off-street parking place orders will be needed as well as a 21-day consultation period to advertise the changes to the public.

12. CARBON REDUCTION/SOCIAL VALUE IMPLICATIONS

The reduction of cash collections on the pay and display machines and the need for the patrols to visit the machines will reduce the Parking Contractors carbon footprint.

13. CUSTOMER IMPACT

This policy would impact all motorists in the Borough who use the parking facilities provided.

| | |
|---|---|
| Non-Applicable Headings: | PERSONNEL IMPLICATIONS, PROCUREMENT IMPLICATIONS |
| Background Documents: (Access via Contact Officer) | Proposal to remove Pay and Display Machines – 19/11/19 <u>Agenda item - PROPOSAL TO REMOVE PAY AND DISPLAY MACHINES (bromley.gov.uk)</u> |